

An Analysis of Subtitle Translation Strategies in Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children

Joanna Felicia Andrianto¹⁾, Reski Ramadhani²⁾

^{1,2}English Literature Focusing on Translation, Faculty of Law, Social and Political Sciences, Open University of Indonesia; English Language Education, Garut Institute of Technology

*e-mail: joannafelicia31@gmail.com¹, reski_ramadhani@itg.ac.id²

ABSTRACT

This study examines subtitle translation strategies in the official Indonesian subtitles of Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children (2016), directed by Tim Burton. Guided by Pedersen's (2011) seven-strategy typological framework, the study employs a descriptive qualitative approach with content analysis as its primary method. A corpus of 44 purposively selected subtitle segments, drawn from Blu-ray rip files and cross-verified against official subtitles on Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar, was analyzed across four fantasy genre components: invented neologisms, world-building references, meaningful character names, and fantasy idioms and metaphors. Findings reveal that only three strategies were present in the corpus. Retention was dominant (68.2%), consistently applied to fantasy-specific neologisms such as ymbryne, hollowgast, and peculiar. Specification accounted for 22.7% of cases, used exclusively for the world-building term "loop" rendered as *lingkaran waktu*, while Direct Translation comprised the remaining 9.1%, applied to peculiarity as *keanehan*. The four remaining strategies were absent. The overall source-oriented tendency reflects translators' preference for terminological fidelity over cultural adaptation. These findings offer practical implications for subtitle translators and contribute to the growing body of audiovisual translation (AVT) research in Indonesia.

Keywords: *audiovisual translation, fantasy genre, film translation, subtitles, translation strategies*



This is an open access article under the [CC-BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) international license.

1. INTRODUCTION

Over the past few decades, the global film industry has experienced extraordinary growth, with the fantasy genre standing out as one of the most prominent, both commercially and artistically. A representative work in this genre is *Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children* (2016), a dark fantasy film adapted from the best-selling novel by Ransom Riggs. The plot follows the journey of a teenager named Jacob (Jake) Portman, who, following his grandfather's mysterious disappearance, gradually uncovers hidden secrets that lead him to an orphanage on a remote island in Wales. There, he discovers a community of children with extraordinary abilities who are trapped in a time loop as a form of protection from the dangerous creatures that continue to hunt them. The richness of invented terminology, the construction of an imaginary world, and the complex layers of cultural references make this film a significant challenge for subtitle translators. As Safi'i et al. (2026) point out, subtitle translation is not merely a process of language transfer but also the transfer of specific cultural elements from one culture to another. In the Indonesian context, this challenge is growing as streaming platforms like Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar expand rapidly, significantly increasing viewers' exposure to foreign fantasy content.

The quality and consistency of subtitle translations play a major role in determining how well viewers can understand the narrative and fully immerse themselves in the story. Szarkowska

et al. (2021) argue that high-quality subtitles are generally defined by professionals as those that condense the text to the maximum; yet, paradoxically, viewers often feel dissatisfied with this approach because some information from the audio is not conveyed, leading to a mismatch between what is heard and what is read. This tension feels particularly critical in fantasy films, where genre-specific terminology and elements of fictional world-building demand consistent handling. Globalization and technological advancements have been the primary forces driving the convergence of professional practices in the world of subtitling, although minor differences between countries and organizations in the application of these technologies remain inevitable (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2021).

In general, a translation strategy is understood as a set of systematic decisions made by translators to address specific issues encountered during the translation process. Translators do not work literally, word for word, but rather apply specific approaches to overcome linguistic, stylistic, and cultural barriers that arise between two languages. Baker & Saldanha (2020) note that translation studies have now evolved to a stage that reflects such a wide diversity of perspectives that translators often feel overwhelmed in determining the direction of their work a situation that leads some of them to focus solely on a single approach without considering other possibilities. The theoretical framework used in this study is Pedersen's (2011) typology of subtitling strategies, as outlined in *Subtitling Norms for Television*, which classifies strategies into seven categories: *Retention*, *Specification*, *Direct Translation*, *Generalization*, *Substitution*, *Omission*, and *Official Equivalent*. Pedersen (2011) also emphasizes that a subtitler's responsibilities extend beyond segmentation, timing, and translation to include the editing of text as one of the most crucial tasks. This framework is particularly relevant for analyzing how translators handle extralinguistic cultural references and invented terms—two elements that are characteristic of the fantasy genre itself.

Previous research on subtitle translation in Indonesia has largely focused on action and general drama genres, so specific analyses of the fantasy genre remain relatively scarce and have not received adequate attention. Three relevant yet distinct studies from this research can concretely illustrate this gap. First, Safi'i et al. (2026) examined the translation of cultural references in the Indonesian local animated short film *Nussa*, focusing on trends of domestication and foreignization within a non-fantasy context a perspective markedly different from studies of Western fantasy terminology. Second, El-Farahaty & Alwazna (2024) examined the translation of Netflix subtitles between Arabic and English, emphasizing cultural sensitivity and legal-religious terminology within a bilingual Middle Eastern context offering a different language pair and cultural dynamics from the Indonesian-English context in this fantasy study. Third, (Lu, 2025) examines the translation of neologisms in the *Harry Potter* film adaptations through the lens of literary adaptation fidelity and multimodal analysis, without systematically applying all seven of Pedersen's typological strategies comprehensively to a single film corpus. In light of this gap, this study is the first empirical-qualitative analysis to apply Pedersen's (2011) comprehensive typological framework to Tim Burton's fantasy films in the context of Indonesian subtitles.

This study addresses two research questions derived from gaps in the existing audiovisual translation literature. First, how are Pedersen's (2011) subtitle translation strategies distributed across fantasy-specific linguistic elements, namely invented neologisms, world-building references, meaningful character names, and fantasy idioms and metaphors in the official Indonesian subtitles of *Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children*? Second, to what extent does the predominance of Retention and Specification in translating these fantasy-specific elements

indicate a source-oriented translational approach in the Indonesian subtitle versions distributed via Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar? Accordingly, this study aims to (1) identify and map the dominant subtitle translation strategies in the Indonesian subtitles of the film, and (2) evaluate how these strategies function in relation to the specific demands of the fantasy genre. The scope of this study is deliberately limited to a corpus of 44 subtitles purposively selected from the official subtitles on streaming platforms, with Blu-ray rips serving as the primary data source.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study employed a descriptive-analytical qualitative research design to examine subtitle translation strategies in the fantasy film *Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children* (2016). A qualitative approach was selected because it enables an in-depth exploration of the complexities inherent in audiovisual translation, particularly the linguistic and cultural considerations involved in rendering fantasy-specific expressions. Quantitative approaches alone are insufficient to capture the nuanced decision-making processes underlying subtitle translation. As Gonzales (2019) argues, contemporary audiovisual translation (AVT) research increasingly focuses on identifying both established and emerging translation modes, examining the conditions under which they operate, and analyzing the impact of technological and cultural developments on translation practices.

The study utilized two primary sources of data: the English subtitles as the source language (SL) and the official Indonesian subtitles as the target language (TL), both taken from *Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children* (2016). The SL subtitles were obtained from Blu-ray rip files available through SUBDL and MuSubs, while the TL subtitles were taken from the official Indonesian versions distributed via Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar, as verified in 2023. The initial corpus consisted of 1,571 subtitle segments. Through purposive sampling, segments containing at least one fantasy-related element were selected for analysis, resulting in a final corpus of 44 subtitle segments. These were classified into four categories: invented terms and neologisms (24 items), world-building references (10 items), meaningful character names (6 items), and fantasy idioms and metaphors (4 items). The corpus construction followed the principle that systematic documentation constitutes an essential component of audiovisual translation research (Bogucki & Deckert, 2020).

Data collection and analysis followed the interactive analytical model proposed by Miles, Huberman, and Saldana (2014), comprising data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. Subtitle files in .srt format were first collected and repeatedly verified through multiple viewings of the film to ensure transcription accuracy. Source and target subtitle pairs were manually aligned according to their timestamps and subsequently cross-checked with the official Indonesian subtitle versions from Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar. The study also acknowledges that subtitle translation quality may be influenced by practical constraints such as limited production time, budgetary restrictions, and evaluation procedures (Yonamine, 2022).

Following corpus preparation, purposive sampling reduced the complete dataset to the 44 analytically relevant subtitle segments. Each segment was independently coded by two researchers using Pedersen's (2011) seven-category translation strategy taxonomy. The coding process consisted of four stages: identifying the fantasy-related element, aligning the corresponding target-language subtitle, determining the translation strategy by comparing the source and target renderings according to Pedersen's definitional criteria, and classifying the strategy as either source-oriented or target-oriented. To ensure coding reliability, inter-rater

agreement was calculated using Cohen's Kappa coefficient, while any discrepancies were resolved through discussion until consensus was achieved.

The coded data were subsequently organized into structured frequency distribution tables and cross-tabulated according to fantasy element categories and translation orientation. The findings were interpreted by identifying patterns in the application of translation strategies and relating them to Pedersen's (2011) theoretical framework and broader scholarship in audiovisual translation. Particular attention was given to explaining the rationale behind dominant strategic choices in addressing the genre-specific and culture-bound characteristics of fantasy terminology. The analytical framework of this study is primarily based on Pedersen's (2011) taxonomy of subtitle translation strategies, which consists of seven categories: Retention, Specification, Direct Translation, Generalization, Substitution, Omission, and Official Equivalent. This framework was complemented by the audiovisual translation principles proposed by Díaz Cintas and Remael (2021), which provide broader insights into subtitle translation practices. In addition, the concept of cultural reference developed by El-Farahaty and Alwazna (2024) informed the analysis by explaining how lexical items embedded in the source culture may possess denotative and connotative meanings that differ from those available in the target culture, thereby requiring culturally sensitive translation decisions.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Frequency Distribution of Translation Strategies

Upon classifying all 44 corpus elements according to Pedersen's (2011) typology, it was found that only three of the seven available strategies were employed. The remaining four Official Equivalent, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission recorded zero occurrences throughout the entire dataset. A comprehensive breakdown of these findings is presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Frequency Distribution of Subtitle Translation Strategies Based on Pedersen's (2011) Typology

No.	Translation Strategy	Frequency (n)	Percentage (%)	Orientation
1	Retention	30	68.2%	Source-Oriented
2	Specification	10	22.7%	Target-Oriented
3	Direct Translation	4	9.1%	Target-Oriented
4	Official Equivalent	0	0%	Source-Oriented
5	Generalization	0	0%	Target-Oriented
6	Substitution	0	0%	Target-Oriented
7	Omission	0	0%	Target-Oriented
	TOTAL	44	100%	

Source: Primary data analysis, 2024

As shown in Table 1, an analysis of 44 subtitle units using the seven-strategy translation framework proposed by Pedersen (2011) revealed that the retention strategy dominated, appearing 30 times; this is due to the characteristics of fantasy world terminology, which includes neologisms, proper names, and fictional concepts. That lacks adequate lexical or cultural equivalents in Indonesian, so retaining the original form of the lexeme is considered the most appropriate choice to preserve the distinctiveness and integrity of that fictional world's identity. The specification strategy was recorded as used 10 times, specifically in situations where a term had the potential to cause ambiguity for the target readers; for example, by adding a temporal modifier to the word "loop" to form "lingkaran waktu", which serves to clarify the meaning without sacrificing the source lexeme. Meanwhile, direct translation was applied in four cases where the target language already possessed a lexeme with equivalent semantic content, while the other four strategies—official equivalents, generalization, substitution, and omission—were not found at all in this corpus, given that the fantasy text analyzed did not present a context requiring formal replacement, semantic expansion, or the omission of information.

Among the three strategies identified, Retention emerged as the most frequently utilized, accounting for 30 data points, or 68.2% of the total. Specification followed with 10 instances (22.7%), and Direct Translation was recorded in 4 instances (9.1%). The complete absence of Official Equivalent, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission points to a translation approach that is consistently oriented toward the source text and remains faithful to its original terminology.

3.2 Distribution of Strategies Based on Fantasy Genre Components

As illustrated in Table 2, the application of strategies differs in a systematic manner across the four categories of fantasy genre components.

Table 2. Distribution of Translation Strategies Based on Fantasy Genre Components

Fantasy Component	n	%	Dominant Strategy	Dominant Orientation
Invented Term (Neologism)	24	54.5%	Retention	Source-Oriented
World-Building References	10	22.7%	Specification	Target-Oriented
Character Name Meaning	6	13.6%	Retention	Source-Oriented
Fantasy Idiom & Metaphor	4	9.1%	Direct Translation	Target-Oriented
TOTAL	44	100%	Source-Oriented (68.2%)	

Source: Primary data analysis, 2024

Table 2 shows the distribution of translation strategies based on the elements of the fantasy genre found in the data. The "invented terms" category accounts for the largest share with 24 entries, or 54.5% of the total data, and all were handled using the retention strategy, given that attempting to replace neologisms such as "Ymbryne" or "Hollowgast" with other equivalents risks disrupting the aesthetic coherence of the fictional world that has been established. As for world-building

references, which number 10 entries or 22.7%, they were predominantly addressed through the specification strategy, as terms with significant narrative functions require additional conceptual clarity to be accurately understood by the target readers. The “character names” category, comprising 6 instances or 13.6%, generally retained their original forms as well, since translating these names risks eroding the connotative meaning inherent in the characters’ identities within the story. Finally, fantasy idioms and metaphors, comprising 4 data points or 9.1%, were resolved through direct translation in cases where the target language provided an adequate semantic equivalent, as reflected in the translation of “peculiarity” into “keanehan”.

3.3 Translation Orientation: Source-Oriented vs. Target-Oriented

Table 3. Translation Orientation: Source-Oriented vs. Target-Oriented

Orientation	Strategy	n	%	Implication
Source-Oriented	Retention	30	68.2%	Maintaining the fidelity and consistency of the fantasy world brand
Target-Oriented	Direct Translation, Specification, Generalization, Substitution, Omission	14	31.8%	Adaptation for readability and understanding by Indonesian audiences
TOTAL	—	44	100%	Dominant Source-Oriented

Source: Adapted from Pedersen (2011, pp. 51-55)

Table 3 classifies all the strategies identified into two opposing theoretical poles. The first pole is the source-oriented approach, which accounts for 68.2% of the total cases and reflects the translators’ tendency to prioritize terminological fidelity, consistency across episodes, and the preservation of the aesthetic identity of the fictional world of the source text. Meanwhile, the second pole, the target-oriented approach, accounts for 31.8% and encompasses adaptation strategies and literal translation, which are selectively applied to specific terms that function narratively or denote temporal concepts deemed crucial for Indonesian-speaking audiences’ understanding.

3.4 Examples of Subtitle Translation Strategy Use

3.4.1 Retention Strategy

Pedersen (2011) describes Retention as the practice of preserving a source-language term in its original form within the target-language subtitle. This strategy is most suitable when the SL term carries cultural specificity or brand identity for which no adequate TL equivalent exists. Within this corpus, Retention proves to be the predominant strategy, recorded in 30 out of 44 data points (68.2%). Its application is illustrated across the three categories in which it is most concentrated: invented terms, character names, and world-building terms.

Table 4. Example of a Subtitle that Uses the Retention Strategy

Timestamp (SL)	SL (English)	TL (Indonesian)	Strategy
00:33:39	You see, I'm a type of peculiar called an Ymbryne.	Aku adalah jenis peculiar yang disebut Ymbryne.	Retention
00:58:51	Ymbrynes are always female.	Ymbryne selalu perempuan.	Retention
01:09:57	We call them Hollowgast.	Kami menyebutnya Hollowgast.	Retention
01:09:59	Hollows for short.	Hollow, singkatnya.	Retention
01:14:13	The Hollows grow more desperate every year...	Hollow semakin nekat setiap tahunnya...	Retention
00:13:04	And this is Millard. He's invisible.	Dan ini Millard. Dia tak terlihat.	Retention
00:33:10	As I was saying, some people are peculiar.	Seperti yang kukatakan, ada orang-orang yang peculiar.	Retention

Source: SUBDL Blu-ray rip SL subtitles; official Indonesian TL (Netflix/Disney+ Hotstar, verified 2023)

Table 4 illustrates the implementation of a retention strategy by retaining terms such as *Ymbryne*, *Hollowgast*, *Hollow*, and *Millard* without any morphological changes; this choice aims to preserve the fictional atmosphere while maintaining terminological consistency for the fan community, although it may increase the cognitive load for viewers encountering the work for the first time.

3.4.2 Specification Strategy

As conceptualized by Pedersen (2011), Specification entails the incorporation of additional information into the target-language text to render an SL concept more accessible to TL audiences who may otherwise find it unclear. This strategy accounts for 10 instances (22.7%) in the corpus. It is applied exclusively to the world-building term "*loop*", which is consistently translated as "*lingkaran waktu*" — a rendering achieved by appending the word "waktu" (time) to the base Indonesian equivalent "lingkaran" (circle/loop).

Table 5. Example of a Subtitle that Uses the Specification Strategy

Timestamp (SL)	SL (English)	TL (Indonesian)	Strategy
00:26:42	before we go into the loop.	sebelum kita masuk ke lingkaran waktu.	Specification
00:29:56	It's our loop.	Ini lingkaran waktu kami.	Specification
00:33:54	and create a loop.	dan menciptakan lingkaran waktu.	Specification
00:33:59	A loop preserves the last 24 hours.	Lingkaran waktu mempertahankan 24 jam terakhir.	Specification
01:08:22	Ymbrynes usually pick the perfect day to create a loop.	Ymbryne biasanya memilih hari yang sempurna untuk menciptakan lingkaran waktu.	Specification
01:34:25	Our old loop's gone for good.	Lingkaran waktu lama kita sudah hilang selamanya.	Specification
01:50:22	Find your children. Create new loops.	Temukan anak-anakmu. Ciptakan lingkaran waktu baru.	Specification

Source: SUBDL Blu-ray rip SL subtitles; official Indonesian TL (Netflix/Disney+ Hotstar, verified 2023)

Table 5 illustrates how the specification strategy is implemented by adding the word “time” to the lexeme “loop”, thereby making previously implicit information explicit to bridge the semantic gap without substantially altering the source term.

3.4.3 Direct Translation Strategy

Direct Translation, as defined by Pedersen (2011), refers to the process of rendering the meaning of the SL term into the TL as faithfully and literally as possible, without the introduction of any explanatory additions. This strategy appears in 4 of the 44 data points (9.1%) and is concentrated within the fantasy idioms and metaphors category, where the term “peculiarity” is rendered as “keanehan” (strangeness/peculiarness).

Table 6. Example of a Subtitle that Uses the Direct Translation Strategy

Timestamp (SL)	SL (English)	TL (Indonesian)	Strategy
00:44:35	So, Jake, what's your peculiarity?	Jadi, Jake, apa keanehanmu?	Direct Translation
01:05:43	It's my peculiarity.	Itu keanehanku.	Direct Translation
01:44:46	as if you had not the gift of peculiarity at all?	seolah kamu tidak memiliki anugerah keanehan sama sekali?	Direct Translation
01:45:25	I take it accuracy is not your peculiarity.	Kuduga akurasi bukan keanehanmu.	Direct Translation

Source: SUBDL Blu-ray rip SL subtitles; official Indonesian TL (Netflix/Disney+ Hotstar, verified 2023)

Table 6 provides an example of the use of direct translation for the word “*peculiarity*”, which has been rendered as “*keanehan*”, a lexical equivalent deemed capable of conveying both its denotative meaning and some of its connotative connotations, thus requiring no further elaboration.

3.4.4 Absent Strategies

The remaining four strategies in Pedersen's typology Official Equivalent, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission were absent from all 44 data points. Rather than being a trivial observation, this complete non-occurrence constitutes a finding of analytical significance. It demonstrates that the translators made no attempt to omit fantasy-specific elements, nor did they resort to standardized institutional equivalents in Indonesian. Without exception, every culturally loaded or genre-specific term in the corpus was handled through one of three approaches: Retention, Specification, or Direct Translation.

3.5 Discussion

3.5.1 The Dominance of the Retention Strategy

Among all findings in this study, the most prominent is the near-total prevalence of Retention, which accounts for 68.2% of all strategy applications. This strategy was employed uniformly across every character name and all core invented terms including *peculiar*, *ymbryne*, *hollowgast*, *hollow*, and *wight*. From the standpoint of narrative integrity, preserving original invented terminology represents the most defensible choice within the fantasy genre. Beyond segmentation, timing, and translation itself, subtitlers bear additional professional responsibilities; among these, the text editing function is particularly consequential a duty that grows even more demanding in fantasy contexts, where coined terms frequently have no workable equivalents in the target language (Pedersen, 2011). A term such as “*ymbryne*” an entirely original coinage by Ransom Riggs with no grounding in any real-world referent demands Retention not merely as a practical measure but as a narratively principled one. As Lu (2025) warns, borrowing terminology from pre-existing literary translations may appear efficient, yet it carries inherent risks of distorting the source film script, given the polysemic character of cinematic texts. Furthermore, Retention serves to maintain terminological alignment with the Indonesian translation of the source novel already in circulation an issue that Baker & Saldanha (2020) recognize as a fundamental challenge confronting translation studies in the face of wide methodological diversity.

3.5.2 Specification as the Second Strategy: World-Building Clarity

One of the notable outcomes in this corpus is the comparatively high frequency of Specification at 22.7%. This figure reflects the actual recurrence of the term “*loop*” across the film's subtitle files: examination of the Blu-ray rip data reveals 10 distinct occurrences in which “*loop*” is rendered not simply as “*lingkaran*” but as “*lingkaran waktu*.” The deliberate insertion of “*waktu*” (time) clarifies that the loop being referenced is a temporal cycle a fundamental mechanism of the film's world-building rather than a mere geometric shape. Subtitle translation requires the transfer of culturally embedded elements across linguistic and cultural boundaries, and Specification is the instrument best suited to managing this transfer when the SL term lacks immediate intelligibility in the TL (Safi'i et al., 2026). The selective and consistent deployment of this strategy toward a single conceptually dense term reflects a considered rather than mechanical approach: explanatory content was introduced only where narrative comprehension genuinely required it, while all properly invented terms, such as *ymbryne*, *hollowgast*, and *hollow*, remained under Retention.

3.5.3 Direct Translation of Fantasy Idioms and Metaphors

Direct Translation, representing 9.1% of strategy applications and confined to the idioms-and-metaphors category, renders "*peculiarity*" as "keanehan" across all four relevant instances. This rendering achieves both linguistic accuracy and contextual coherence: "keanehan" (strangeness/peculiarness) successfully conveys the notion of an exceptional and distinguishing quality without assimilating it into a domesticated Indonesian cultural concept. Cultural references encompass those lexical items in the source text that are either foreign or semantically divergent from their counterparts in the target culture, in both their literal and figurative dimensions (El-Farahaty & Alwazna, 2024). The convergence of professional subtitling practices at the global level has been driven largely by the forces of globalization and technological advancement, although some variation persists across different national and institutional contexts (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2021). It is this convergence that enables a term as broadly intelligible as "*peculiarity*" to be rendered directly without undermining its comprehensibility for Indonesian viewers.

3.5.4 The Absence of Omission and Other Pedersen Strategies

The fact that four of Pedersen's strategies Official Equivalent, Omission, Generalization, and Substitution were entirely unrepresented across all 44 data points ranks among the most analytically consequential findings of this study. The complete non-occurrence of Omission signals a translator's commitment to rendering every world-building element in full, standing in direct contrast to the concern expressed by Szarkowska et al. (2021) that professional subtitlers frequently sacrifice informational completeness in favor of textual compression. The absence of Official Equivalent, meanwhile, confirms that none of the 44 fantasy-specific elements possesses a formally recognized or institutionally standardized Indonesian counterpart an outcome that is entirely anticipated given the highly invented nature of the terminology involved. Although translation quality is widely understood to be subject to external pressures such as tight deadlines, limited budgets, and deficient quality evaluation mechanisms (Yonamine, 2022), the translators in this corpus appear to have placed terminological integrity above considerations of expediency. Baker & Saldanha (2020) observe that translators may gravitate toward a narrow repertoire of familiar strategies; in this case, however, the restricted set of three strategies does not appear incidental but rather deliberate and genre-appropriate.

3.5.5 Implications of Source-Oriented Dominance

The 68.2% prevalence of source-oriented translation in this study reflects a broader pattern inherent to fan-driven fantasy localization: when a genre cultivates a dedicated fandom with strong attachment to the original source material terminology, a source-oriented approach becomes virtually unavoidable. The terminological consistency that results from this orientation facilitates reception among audiences already acquainted with Riggs's novels. At the same time, it risks constructing an accessibility barrier for newcomers encountering terms such as "*ymbryne*" or "*hollowgast*" without any prior exposure to the source material. Bogucki & Deckert (2020) identify the documentation of audiovisual translation's evolution as a matter of scholarly urgency, and this finding constitutes an empirically grounded contribution to that ongoing effort. Lu (2025) similarly draws attention to the polysemic risks that arise when translation decisions privilege brand consistency at the expense of textual adaptation a tension that remains unresolved in this corpus and merits further inquiry. Collectively, these findings suggest that subtitle translation strategies within the fantasy genre form a distinctive ecosystem in which fidelity to world-building terminology consistently takes precedence over cultural domestication. This opens a

broader discussion regarding the optimal balance between source fidelity and target-audience accessibility within Indonesia's rapidly expanding content localization industry.

3.5.6 Research Contributions

The previous studies discussed above each make a significant theoretical contribution; however, collectively, they still leave an unexplored gap, namely the lack of empirical studies that comprehensively apply Pedersen's (2011) typology to Western fantasy films with the English-Indonesian language pair as their subject of study; differences in the genres studied, the language combinations used, and the inconsistent scope of typological categories make it difficult to directly generalize these findings to the context of translating fantasy terminology in Indonesian subtitles. Recognizing this gap, this study aims to fill that void by positioning itself as a qualitative-empirical study that, for the first time, systematically applies Pedersen's (2011) classification framework to a Western fantasy film directed by Tim Burton, "*Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children*", in the context of subtitle translation into Indonesian. Utilizing a corpus of 44 official subtitle data points sourced from streaming platforms and Blu-ray rips, this study sets two primary objectives: first, to identify and map the most dominant subtitle translation strategies based on Pedersen's classification system; and second, to evaluate the extent to which these strategies meet the specific demands of the fantasy genre, particularly in handling neologisms, character naming conventions, and world-building elements that distinguish this genre (Pedersen, 2011).

4. CONCLUSION

This study analyzed 44 purposively selected elements drawn from the official Indonesian subtitles of *Miss Peregrine's Home for Peculiar Children* (2016), sourced from Blu-ray rip SL subtitle files and cross-verified against TL subtitles available on Netflix and Disney+ Hotstar. Three substantive conclusions are formulated on the basis of Pedersen's (2011) typological framework. The first conclusion concerns overall translation orientation. The data reveal a pronounced tendency toward source-oriented translation (68.2%) as opposed to target-oriented (31.8%), indicating that translators accorded greater priority to faithfulness and terminological coherence within the fantasy world than to adaptation for the target culture. This orientation is attributable entirely to the Retention strategy, which was applied in 30 of the 44 data points. The second conclusion pertains to the systematic variation observed in strategy distribution across fantasy genre components. Retention predominates in the invented terms category (54.5% of corpus, $n = 24$) and character names (13.6%, $n = 6$). Specification is applied selectively and consistently to world-building references — specifically to the term "*loop*", rendered as "lingkaran waktu" accounting for 22.7% ($n = 10$). Direct Translation addresses all instances within the fantasy idioms and metaphors category, specifically rendering "*peculiarity*" as "keanehan" (9.1%, $n = 4$). This variation demonstrates the translator's awareness of the functional distinctions among different fantasy genre components.

The third conclusion concerns strategy activation. Of Pedersen's seven available strategies, only three were employed: Retention (68.2%), Specification (22.7%), and Direct Translation (9.1%). The four remaining strategies Official Equivalent, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission were absent. This absence is analytically significant in its own right, as it corroborates both the source-oriented character of the translation and the complete absence of element compression or cultural domestication within the corpus.

Several recommendations arise from these findings. For professional subtitle translators engaged with fantasy content, the development of standardized fantasy terminology glossaries is

encouraged to ensure consistency across related titles within the same franchise or genre. Streaming platforms and localization companies are urged to produce genre-specific style guides supported by official glossaries derived from existing source-novel translations. For future research, three directions are proposed: (a) a systematic comparison of official subtitles and fan-produced subtitles in fantasy films, aimed at determining whether fansubs exhibit stronger domestication tendencies; (b) an investigation into how Indonesian audiences receive source-oriented subtitles, particularly in assessing whether the consistent retention of invented terms creates comprehension difficulties; and (c) a cross-franchise comparative mapping of translation strategies across major fantasy titles such as *Harry Potter* or *The Lord of the Rings*, which would offer a richer understanding of fantasy subtitle translation norms in the Indonesian context.

REFERENCES

- Baker, M., & Saldanha, G. (2020). *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (3rd ed.). Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group. <https://www.routledge.com/Routledge-Encyclopedia-of-Translation-Studies/Baker-Saldanha/p/book/9781032088709>
- Bogucki, L., & Deckert, M. (2020). *The Palgrave Handbook of Audiovisual Translation and Media Accessibility*. Palgrave Macmillan. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/340088846_The_Palgrave_Handbook_of_Audiovisual_Translation_and_Media_Accessibility
- Diaz-Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2021). *Subtitling: Concepts and Practices*. Routledge. <https://www.routledge.com/Subtitling-Concepts-and-Practices/DiazCintas-Remael/p/book/9781138940543>
- El-Farahaty, H., & Alwazna, R. Y. (2024). Translating Cultural References and Sensitive Elements Between Arabic and English: Netflix Subtitles as a Case Study. *Sage Open*, 14(2), 21582440241258293. <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440241258293>
- Gonzales, L.-P. (2019). *The Routledge Handbook of Audiovisual Translation*. Routledge. <https://www.routledge.com/The-Routledge-Handbook-of-Audiovisual-Translation/Perez-Gonzalez/p/book/9781032094908>
- Lu, S. (2025). How existing literary translation fits into film adaptations: The subtitling of neologisms in *Harry Potter* from a multimodal perspective. *Visual Communication*, 24(2), 485–507. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14703572221141959>
- Pedersen, J. (2011). *Subtitling Norms for Television: An Exploration Focusing on Extralinguistic Cultural References*. John Benjamins Publishing Company. https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Subtitling_Norms_for_Television.html?id=KOo7mfiXibUC&redir_esc=y
- Safi'i, M., Panggabean, H. M., Losi, R. V., Fadli, A., & Siregar, T. M. (2026). *Translation of Cultural References in the English Subtitles of Nussa Short Movie Special Edition: 'Kamu... Antta'*. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/403884153_Translation_of_Cultural_References_in_the_English_Subtitles_of_Nussa_Short_Movie_Special_Edition_'Kamu_Antta'
- Szarkowska, A., Díaz Cintas, J., & Gerber-Morón, O. (2021). Quality is in the eye of the stakeholders: What do professional subtitlers and viewers think about subtitling? *Universal Access in the Information Society*, 20(4), 661–675. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10209-020-00739-2>
- Yonamine, M. (2022). Domestication and foreignization in interlingual subtitling: A systematic review of contemporary research. *The International Journal of Translation and Interpreting Research*, 14(1). <https://doi.org/10.12807/ti.114201.2022.a11>